

*ble outcome, addressed at particular groups of recipients, and requiring major, though limited, tangible and intangible assets (material, human, financial)*².

Understanding what project elements are key for its success is very important at the project development (concept) stage. Therefore, knowledge regarding project evaluation criteria may aid its proper development; i.e. all aspects crucial for a project to be successful would be properly investigated and organised.

As far as assistance programmes project evaluation is concerned, first and foremost a project should set forth general objectives of the programme it is going to be funded from. For the purpose of project evaluation, evaluation criteria are presented to applicants in a competition dossier. Each particular aspect of a project is assessed and projects who score best rank high and have the greatest chance of receiving a subsidy. Prior to substance evaluation though, the project is assessed in terms of the level of observance of formal criteria.

Project management, especially social projects management, employs the following terms for describing project outcomes: "hard outcomes" and "soft outcomes"³. A characteristic feature of "hard outcomes" is that they can be defined quantitatively (they are measurable), whereas the "soft outcomes" are qualitative in nature and are typically presented in a descriptive form. Thus, an objective project evaluation becomes challenging. Another problem is whether an assessment of project's outcomes is in accordance with the funds provided for project implementation and subsidised by the European Union (which means that they are public funds). The objective of the article is to indicate difficulties associated with qualitative project evaluation on the basis of a selected project. The empirical data used in the article is a project competing for subsidies from the "Cross-border Cooperation Programme Poland-Belarus-Ukraine 2007-2013".

The evaluation criteria in Cross-border Cooperation Programme Poland-Belarus-Ukraine 2007-2013

The European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument is the initiative of the European Commission, aiming at developing the cooperation between the European Union and the partner countries by ensuring the integrated and sustainable regional development. The European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument - Cross-border Cooperation Programmes will take as their starting point the four key objectives described in the response strategy⁴:

² *Podręcznik zarządzania projektami miękkimi w kontekście Europejskiego Funduszu Społecznego*, Ministerstwo Rozwoju Regionalnego, Warszawa 2006, p. 8.

³ www.eu.progressinvestment.eu/ (01.06.2012).

⁴ *European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument Cross-Border Cooperation. Strategy Paper 2007-2013. Indicative Programme 2007-2010*, European Commission, 2007, p. 24.

- promoting economic and social development in regions on both sides of common borders,
- working together to address common challenges, in fields such as the environment, public health and the prevention of and the fight against organized crime,
- ensuring efficient and secure borders,
- promoting local cross border “people-to-people” actions.

The Cross-border Cooperation Programme Poland-Belarus-Ukraine 2007-2013, under the European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument continues and broadens the cooperation in the border zone areas of the three countries, which so far has been developed within the framework of the Neighbourhood Programme Poland-Belarus-Ukraine INTERREG IIIA / Tacis CBC 2004–2006 (Neighbourhood Programme). Despite substantial progress in cross-border cooperation, the level of integration in the programme area needs further improvement in order to realise and utilise the full social and economic potential of the region. All the more so, since the programme area’s economic development is still insufficient, with a comparatively low GDP per capita, a very high unemployment rate on the Polish side of the border, high share of agriculture in the employment structure, a relatively low innovativeness of SMEs, R&D spending and technical environmental standards⁵.

Cross-border Cooperation Programme Poland - Belarus - Ukraine 2007-2013 was approved by the European Commission on November 6th 2008 – Decision number K(2008)6411. The core objective of the programme is support for cross-border development processes. The programme objectives will be realised through non-commercial projects implemented within the following priorities and measures⁶:

Priority 1. Increasing competitiveness of the border area:

- Measure 1.1. Better conditions for entrepreneurship
- Measure 1.2. Tourism development
- Measure 1.3. Improving access to the region

Priority 2. Improving the quality of life:

- Measure 2.1. Natural environment protection in the borderland
- Measure 2.2. Efficient and secure borders

Priority 3. Networking and people-to-people cooperation:

- Measure 3.1. Regional and local cross-border cooperation capacity building
- Measure 3.2. Local communities’ initiatives

The goal of Measure 3.1 – Regional and local cross-border cooperation capacity building – is to improve the cross-border cooperation capacity at the local and regional level. Support is planned mainly for activities aimed at increasing the institutional cooperation. It is expected to develop as a re-

⁵ *Cross-Border Cooperation Programme Poland – Belarus – Ukraine 2007-2013*, European Commission, 6 November 2008 (Decision number K(2008)6411), p. 3.

⁶ <http://www.pl-by-ua.eu/> (25.02.2012).

sult of the creation of institutional forms of cross border cooperation. Information exchange, experience sharing and networking cooperation will be promoted, including internet-based projects. Cooperation among public institutions, especially territorial self-governments, is of high importance, particularly in the area of strategic and spatial planning. Joint initiatives in the respective areas will be promoted with a view to increasing the degree of integration of the Programme's eligible areas. Within the Programme's scope, particular stress will be laid on the dissemination of "good practices". Additionally it is planned to support the development and use of information and communication technologies for cross-border cooperation⁷.

All projects submitted by applicants will be assessed according to the following steps and criteria:

- Step 1: administrative/ eligibility verification
- Step 2: quality evaluation

Table 1. The evaluation criteria

1. Financial and operational capacity
1.1. Do the applicant and partners have sufficient experience of project management?
1.2. Do the applicant and partners have sufficient technical expertise and management capacity? (including staff, equipment, knowledge and ability to handle the budget for the action)
1.3. Does the applicant and financial partner have stable and sufficient sources of finance?
2. Relevance
2.1. How relevant is the proposal to the objectives and one or more of the priorities of the call for proposals? (score "very good" will only be allocated if the proposal contains specific added-value elements, such as promotion of gender equality and equal opportunities , innovative approaches, models for good practice, information and communication technology, economical impact, social impact etc.)
2.2. Cross-border impact. How does the Project contribute to the straightening of cross-border co- operation (e.g. creates basis to develop cross border co-operation/ results benefits both sides of the border/ demonstrate clear links to future cross- border co-operation)
2.3. How relevant to the particular needs and constraints of the target country/countries or region(s) is the proposal? (including regional strategies/ plans or other relevant documents, avoidance of duplication and synergy with other EC initiatives.)
2.4. How clearly defined and strategically chosen are those involved (final beneficiaries, target groups)? Have their needs been clearly defined and does the proposal address them appropriately?
3. Methodology
3.1. Are the activities proposed appropriate, practical, and consistent with the objectives and expected results? Does the action demonstrate innovative approach?

⁷ *Cross-Border Co-Operation Programme Poland - Belarus - Ukraine 2007-2013. Guidelines for grant applicants*, Ministry of Regional Development of Poland, Territorial Cooperation Department, Warszawa 2011, pp. 6-7.

3.2. How coherent is the overall design of the action? Is the action plan clear and feasible? (in particular, does it reflect the analysis of the problems involved, take into account external factors and anticipate an evaluation? A score "very good" may only be allocated if the project is ready for implementation)
3.3. Is the partners' and/or other stakeholders' level of involvement and participation in the action satisfactory?
3.4. Does the proposal contain objectively verifiable indicators Have the indicators been properly chosen?
4. Sustainability
4.1. Is the action likely to have a tangible impact on its target groups? Is the proposal likely to have multiplier effects? (including scope for replication and extension of the outcome of the action and dissemination of information.)
4.2. Are the expected results of the proposed action sustainable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • financially (how will the activities be financed after the EC funding ends?) • institutionally (will structures allowing the activities to continue be in place at the end of the action? Will there be local "ownership" of the results of the action?) • environmentally (where applicable) (will the action have a negative/positive environmental impact?)
5. Budget and cost-effectiveness
5.1. Is the ratio between the estimated costs and the expected results satisfactory?
5.2. Is the proposed expenditure necessary for the implementation of the action? Is the budget transparent and adequately related to the planned actions?
6. Partnership
6.1. How satisfactory is the level of involvement and activities of the cross-border partners, the project has been: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • jointly prepared • the project will be jointly implemented • the project will have shared staff • the project will be jointly financed <p>Note "very good" may only be allocated if the project fulfils all above mentioned criteria (partners participate in preparation, implementation of the project, have financial contribution -eligible costs only- and joint staff) and only to the projects with the balanced division of the budget between the project partners.</p>
Maximum total score: 100

Source: *Cross-Border Co-Operation Programme Poland - Belarus - Ukraine 2007-2013. Guidelines for grant applicants*, Ministry of Regional Development of Poland, Territorial Cooperation Department, Warszawa 2011, pp. 32-33.

Cross-border project on "Regional and local cross-border cooperation capacity building" - case study

The case study refers to the project: "Closer neighbour. Polish-Ukrainian transborder cooperation platform for socioeconomic development planning"⁸, to be submitted for support from the Cross-border Cooperation Programme Poland – Belarus – Ukraine 2007-2013. The Applicant is Centre for Local Development Foundation located in Lublin (Poland), and the Part-

⁸ Project: "Closer neighbour. Polish-Ukrainian transborder cooperation platform for socioeconomic development planning", Fundacja Centrum Rozwoju Lokalnego, Lublin 2012.

ners: Tomaszow Lubelski Powiat (Poland), Zolkiev District Council (Ukraine) and Sokal District Council (Ukraine).

The general goal of project is building a sustainable platform for cross-border cooperation through the establishment of a planning instruments and achieving socio-economic development of bordering Ukraine and creating a permanent network of cross-border cooperation. Specific objectives are:

1. Development of Polish-Ukrainian cooperation on border areas.
2. Creating structures exchange mutual experience and information top stimulate and planning the socio-economic development of border areas.
3. Strengthening NGO (non-governmental organisations) cooperation and entrepreneurs with the administration by providing practical knowledge concerning the functioning of a democratic state conditions and economy.

The general action in the project are: conferences, trainings in Ukraine, study visits in Poland, study visits in Ukraine, strategic planning workshops and organizing Transboundary Investor Service Centre in Zolkiew (Ukraine). The project will create the basis for the development of cross-border cooperation by preparing decision-making personnel training and workshops. Preparation of substantive representatives of other sectors (NGOs and entrepreneurs) to transfer knowledge and experience will reinforce their potential as partner administration. Skills training should be profitable. Trained person will experience with colleagues by multiplying effect project. This helps build the structures for transboundary consultations in socio-economic matters. Thanks to fixed firmly to the contacts area covered by the project will have a chance at better use of resources. Through regular, exchanges of information authorities obtain opportunities faster response to crisis situations and avoid problems arising from the lack of coordination of activities on both sides of the border. It also develop a cross-border development strategy. The strategy will uniquely identify the main problems facing these areas and more importantly to find ways their neutralization. Helps develop optional road development in frontier areas. Publishing strategy will contribute to the dissemination of ideas and promote transboundary strategic planning implementation process.

The project will have various effects on both sides of the border. Party of Poland would be seriously improved mainly in terms of socio-economic considerations. Thanks to the support of local authorities on both sides of the border expected more bilateral cooperation initiatives. Particularly for cultural, tourist and business. Should be the development of border trade and cooperation production plants. Predicting a significant improvement planning and utilization of infrastructure and resources. Ukrainian party obtains support processes of construction selfgovernment, civil society more open on proven patterns West. Cooperation structure allowing run initiative grass and enable the new bodies (especially NGOs) to work for the good of those areas. In all partner investment attractiveness is raised areas and tourist border areas. The project will last 2 years. The total value of the project is 499 710,12 EUR. The problem is, if are this total eligible cost of the action

adequate to the results. The major project action plan and they results is showed in logical framework for the project.

Logical framework for the project

A remarkably crucial element of project planning is attention to coherence maintenance between project objectives and the planned project activities. The stage of project formulation is completed by developing a logical framework of the project. The logical framework is in a form of a chart that presents major principles of the project and depicts intervention logic assumed therein. Its purpose is to summarise the analytic-planning part of the project through a concise tabulation and verification of correctness of the cause and effect relations assumed in the project⁹.

Table 2. Logical framework for the project "Closer neighbour. Polish-Ukrainian transborder cooperation platform for socioeconomic development planning"

	Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement	Sources and means of verification	Assumptions
Overall objectives	<i>What are the overall broader objectives to which the action will contribute?</i>	<i>What are the key indicators related to the overall objectives?</i>	<i>What are the sources of information for these indicators?</i>	
	The project aims is to build a sustainable platform for cross-border cooperation through the establishment of a planning instruments and achieving socio-economic development of bordering Ukraine and creating a permanent network of cross-border cooperation	The amount of cross-border local initiatives undertaken by local authorities, NGO's and private sectors. – the level of private sector development measured quantity of person working in this sector. – level effectiveness of governance and management at local and regional – level development NGOs involved in training expressed much	Source information is conducted evaluation indicators project are: Monitoring entities participating in the project. – Maintain permanent contact with the local authorities, non-governmental organizations and entrepreneurs. – Survey conducted during and after project completion	-

⁹ T. Szot-Gabryś, *Projekty inwestycyjne infrastrukturalne i biznesowe. Aspekty metodologiczne i praktyczne [Infrastructure and business investment projects. Methodological and practical aspects.]*, DIFIN, Warszawa 2011, pp. 79-80.

		ongoing projects and taken measures		
Specific objective	<i>What specific objective is the action intended to achieve to contribute to the overall objectives?</i>	<i>Which indicators clearly show that the objective of the action has been achieved?</i>	<i>What are the sources of information that exist or can be collected? What are the methods required to get this information?</i>	<i>Which factors and conditions outside the Beneficiary's responsibility are necessary to achieve that objective? (external conditions). Which risks should be taken into consideration?</i>
	1) Development of Polish- Ukrainian cooperation on border areas 2) The creation of structures exchange mutual experience and information to stimulate and planning the socio-economic development of border areas 3) Strengthening cooperation NGO and private sector administration by providing practical knowledge concerning the functioning of a democratic state conditions and economy	When evaluation qualitative indicator will be taken into account the following elements: - increase knowledge and skills of people trained; - increase awareness of the need and the evolution of economic and Social Committee fluids among participants study visits and conferences; - increase of knowledge and capacity for action among supported TISC ¹⁰ , when assessing the quantitative indicator will be taken into account the following elements: - increase in the activity and mobility participants and persons covered by the project on cross-border cooperation and between sectors (Administration – NGO – private sector);	Source information is conducted evaluation project are: - current monitoring project; - periodic reports local coordinators project; - analysis surveys evaluation; - the project on schedule; - the preparation of periodic reports from the project; - summary of the project during a Conference in Tomaszow	Conditions necessary to achieve this: - support the project by the local authorities; - involvement of actors involved in training; - openness of local and regional cooperation; Factors which may impair or impede implementation process can be : - difficult crossing of Polish-Ukrainian, - currency fluctuations, - political and economic instability in Ukraine.

¹⁰ TISC – Transboundary Investor Service Centre.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - elevation knowledge individual target groups, - a model for the establishment and implementation of development strategies. 		
Expected results	<p><i>The results are the outputs envisaged to achieve the specific objective. What are the expected results? (enumerate them)</i></p>	<p><i>What are the indicators to measure whether and to what extent the action achieves the expected results?</i></p>	<p><i>What are the sources of information for these indicators?</i></p>	<p><i>What external conditions must be met to obtain the expected results on schedule?</i></p>
	<p>1. Conferences During three conferences (opening – 80 people, Investor Centre Transboundary in Zolkiew Conference, near Lwow 60 persons and closing conference – 70 persons) get widespread adoption and promotion ideas trans border collaboration and presentation of project results</p> <p>2. Training in Ukraine In the framework of the project are raised qualifications by trainings in Ukraine for the following numbers of people from land division Sokal and Zolkiew district;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 120 representatives of local authorities (public administration) - 120 representatives of NGSS - 210 familiarizes <p>3. Study visits</p>	<p>In assessing the quantitative indicator will be taken into account the following elements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 450 persons trained in the project; - 135 persons participated in study visits; - 60 persons participated in workshops strategic; - 50 persons participated in workshops strategic; - 50 persons benefiting from the aid TISC; - 210 participants of the Conference; - 3 developed cross-border development strategies, published in including in 300 copies; - 12000 (8000 folders and 4000 promotional materials distributed posters) project and the project; - quantity distributed copies of transboundary guide socioeconomic; - number dialed contacts Polish- 	<p>Post-project evaluation are applied internal procedures, which will be properly assessed the effectiveness of implementation. The project will be evaluated based on the number of trainees, trips and workshops and the number of persons receiving assistance TISC. In addition, the project is expected to determine the effects based on analysis of questionnaires assessing training and travel study carried out under the project. The survey interviews project fulfilled all trainees. In a survey of meaningful will include: the level of meaningful tra-</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Scope of existing cooperation of local authorities, NGOs and small and medium enterprise sector; - Scope already taken initiatives to develop local; - modalities of socio-economic development of Ukraine

	<p>Within the project are raised qualifications by participation in making the following number of participants: 90 people – 6 study visits in Poland: 2 group after 15 entrepreneurs from Ukraine, 2 group after 15 representatives of NGOs from Ukraine, 2 group after 15 representatives of the administration of Ukraine.</p> <p>45 people – 3 study visits in Ukraine.</p> <p><u>4. Workshops</u> Workshops within the framework of the project will be developed divisions and district covered project by participation in workshops of persons: 60 persons – three –day workshops for representatives of local selfgovernment, NGOs and private sectors representative from Poland and Ukraine.</p> <p><u>5. Promotion and publications</u> In the framework of the project will be prepared and distribution:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - bilingual promotional project folders in the effort of 8000 pieces; - bilingual pro- 	<p>Ukrainian relations among target groups of the project. When evaluating qualitative indicator will be taken into account the following factors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the quantity and quality of local initiatives and contacts within the project of developing cooperation between local authorities, NGOs and the private sector; - NGO activity in Ukraine measured quantity initiatives; - growth private sector activity in Ukraine measured quantity employees. 	<p>ining, fitness gained knowledge, training the trainers and the organizational level. All surveys will be analysed and a completed evaluation report.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

	<p>motional posters - 4000 pieces – website; - releases- spot radio; - writing information to local governments; - conference materials</p>			
Activities	<p><i>What are the key activities to be carried out and in what sequence in order to produce the expected results? (group the activities by result)</i></p>	<p>Means: <i>What are the means required to implement these activities, e. g. personnel, equipment, training, studies, supplies, operational facilities, etc.</i></p>	<p><i>What are the sources of information about the action progress?</i> Costs <i>What are the action costs? How are they classified? (breakdown in the Budget for the Action)</i></p>	<p><i>What pre-conditions are required before the action starts?</i> <i>What conditions outside the Beneficiary's direct control have to be met for the implementation of the planned activities?</i></p>
	<p>Action: 1. Appointment and prepare project staff; 2. Preparation of the technical-organization offices, purchase needed equipment and materials, creation of documentation; 3. Promotion project 4. Arranging and conducting the opening conference in Lublin for 80 people; 5. The organization and conducting 2 cycles four-day training in Ukraine for the division for public administration (120 people); 6. The organization and conducting 2 cycles fo-</p>	<p>The measures necessary for the realization of project: <u>Human resources:</u> partner organization staff requesting and managing project, - coaches training essential for component, - experts/consultants essential strategies, - lecturers; - keepers trips, - interpreters, - staff TCOI <u>Equipment:</u> - equipment applicants and partners in computer equipment enabling current communicate and project implementation, training, project offices – 2 and TCOI; in furniture and office supplies <u>Resources:</u> - use material resources of individual pro-</p>	<p>Current monitoring project: - work of the Steering Committee's Draft; - analysis of questionnaires in the evaluation; - the project on schedule; - the preparation of periodic reports from project implementation.</p>	<p>The project requires more accurate diagnosis of problems: -</p>

	<p>ur-day training for NGO division in Ukraine (120 people);</p> <p>7. The organization and conduct of 2 training cycles of 14 days for representatives of private sector in Ukraine (210 persons);</p> <p>8. The organization and conduct of 6 two-day study visits in Poland one for representatives of the administration, NGOs and private sector;</p> <p>9. Primary 3-day study visits in Ukraine one for representatives of the administration, NGOs and private sector from Poland (45 people).</p> <p>10. Organizing activities and ceremonial Polish-Ukrainian Centre investor in Zolkiew near Lwow;</p> <p>11. The activities of cross-border Centre investor;</p> <p>12. A three strategic workshops for representatives of the local Government, NGOs and private sector (60 people) from Poland and Ukraine;</p> <p>13. The development and publication of cross-border strategy development Tomaszow</p>	<p>ject partners, knowledge specific cultural and Social Committee-economic area-good address the needs and circumstances of all participating entities</p> <p><u>Operational facilities</u>: support from local authorities in implementing project-good, multianual contacts with partners</p>		
--	--	--	--	--

	powiat, Sokal and Zolkiew districts (TISC – Transboundary Investor Service Centre); 14 The development and publication of transboundary Guide; 15. The development and publication of folders promoting transborder area project; 16. The organization of Polish-Ukrainian closing conference I Tomaszow (70 people) summary results of the project and presents its effects; 17. Create a Polish-Ukrainian Cross-border association of local communities in Tomaszow;			
--	--	--	--	--

Source: Project: "Closer neighbours. Polish-Ukrainian transborder cooperation platform for socioeconomic development planning", Fundacja Centrum Rozwoju Lokalnego, Lublin 2012.

These results will significantly raise awareness of the necessity of institutionalised cooperation among multilevel groups and their surroundings. Raise substantive competence will develop appropriate beneficiaries schemas and building structures, exchange of experience and consultations. Mutual contacts will give rise to develop common strategies and promotions. Project changes permanently changed the face of cooperation within the impact project between representatives of the three sectors on both sides of the border.

The logical framework is a complex tool applied to the stage of planning project activities and to the subsequent project management. The underlying objective of the construction of the logical framework is to expand the idea of the project and make it operational. The matrix determines intervention logic (if actions are undertaken, the results will be achieved, and so will the project objectives later on etc.) and describes major assumptions

and risks found at the base of logics. This ensures verification of project feasibility¹¹.

Conclusion

Social projects are particularly important as their underlying activities are aimed at mobilisation of certain communities. Social projects are most frequently in the form of trainings, seminars, or study tours. This is the result of intended moulding of skills, awareness and involvement of the participating human resources. Amongst various social projects, transborder projects are especially significant because they feature more barriers - those related to historical and psychological background of project partakers. The assumed outcomes are hard to measure in the case of social projects since they are usually described as intangible or qualitative. As a consequence, it is highly challenging to conduct a proper evaluation of intended actions in terms of financial means provided for them in the project's budget. Another problem would be the ability to run a comparison between projects competing for subsidies. As a result, assessment of social projects is - to a large degree - based on self-perception.

Bibliography

- Aid Delivery Methods. Volume 1: Project Cycle Management Guidelines*, European Commission, Europe Aid Cooperation Office, Brussels 2004.
- Cross-Border Cooperation Programme Poland – Belarus – Ukraine 2007-2013*, European Commission, 6 November 2008 (Decision number K(2008)6411).
- Cross-Border Co-Operation Programme Poland - Belarus - Ukraine 2007-2013. Guidelines for grant applicants*, Ministry of Regional Development of Poland, Territorial Cooperation Department, Warszawa 2011.
- European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument Cross-Border Cooperation. Strategy Paper 2007-2013. Indicative Programme 2007-2010*, European Commission, 2007.
- Podręcznik zarządzania projektami miękkimi w kontekście Europejskiego Funduszu Społecznego*, Ministerstwo Rozwoju Regionalnego, Warszawa 2006.
- Szot-Gabryś T., *Projekty inwestycyjne infrastrukturalne i biznesowe. Aspekty metodologiczne i praktyczne [Infrastructure and business investment projects. Methodological and practical aspects.]*, DIFIN, Warszawa 2011.
- Trocki M., *Zarządzanie projektami [Project Management]*, PWE, Warszawa 2003.
- www.eu.progressinvestment.eu/ (01.06.2012).
- www.pl-by-ua.eu/ (25.02.2012).

¹¹ M. Trocki, *Zarządzanie projektami [Project Management]*, PWE, Warszawa 2003.